

LOG CABIN REPUBLICANS IN OHIO

Richard Hayes Phillips, Ph.D.

In the 2004 general election, Ohio was one of several states in which a constitutional amendment prohibiting gay marriage appeared on the ballot. This is widely believed to have resulted in an unprecedented turnout among rural white evangelical Christians, which helped George W. Bush win the presidential election. In Ohio, the proposition was known as "Issue One."

To investigate the matter, I prepared a table comparing the vote for president with the vote on Issue One, county by county. State wide, Issue One received 61.71% of the vote, whereas Bush, officially, is reputed to have received 50.81% of the vote, a differential of 10.90%. Bush ran 469,567 votes (14.10%) behind the "Yes" votes on Issue One, and Kerry ran 675,705 votes (32.71%) ahead of the "No" votes on Issue One.

ISSUE ONE, STATE WIDE TOTALS

Bush	2,859,768	50.81%	Kerry	2,741,167	48.71%
Yes on 1	3,329,335	61.71%	No on 1	2,065,462	38.29%
Differential	-469,567	14.10%	Differential	675,705	32.71%

However, when I looked at the county totals, I discovered that there were eleven counties in which Bush actually received more votes than Issue One. In three of these counties (Clermont, Delaware and Warren), more people actually voted against Issue One than are reported to have voted for Kerry. That is to say, some people must have voted for gay marriage and for George W. Bush, in some of the most conservative counties of Ohio, or else the official results are not true and correct.

COMPARISON OF VOTE, PRESIDENTIAL AND ISSUE ONE

County	Bush	Yes on 1	Diff.	Kerry	No on 1	Diff.
Clermont	62,949	58,172	4,777	25,887	27,108	-1,221
Delaware	53,143	48,844	4,299	27,048	29,696	-2,648
Warren	68,037	63,431	4,606	26,044	27,960	-1,916

These counties had come to my attention before. Together with Butler County, they provided Bush with his largest margins of victory in Ohio and, with it, the presidency.

PRESIDENTIAL RESULTS, BUSH'S BEST COUNTIES

County	Bush	Kerry	Margin
Butler	109,872	56,243	53,629
Warren	68,037	26,044	41,993
Clermont	62,949	25,887	37,062
Delaware	53,143	27,048	26,095
Subtotal	294,001	135,222	158,779
State Wide	2,859,768	2,741,167	118,601

Bush outpolled Issue One in Butler County as well. The proposition carried by 109,779 votes to 51,462.

To investigate the matter further, I prepared tables comparing the vote totals for President and for Issue One, for every city, village and township in each of the four counties. Those in which Bush ran far ahead of the "Yes" vote on Issue One, and Kerry ran far behind the "No" vote on Issue One, were singled out for closer examination at the precinct level. To calculate the number of gay marriage supporters who must have voted for Bush, I subtracted the "No" votes on Issue One from Kerry's total in each precinct where the result was negative. This is an extremely conservative assumption, because it assumes that Bush received the votes of all voters who supported Issue One, and of all who did not vote on Issue One. For each of these who voted for Kerry, and there must have been some, there would have to be yet another gay marriage supporter who voted for Bush.

DELAWARE COUNTY

Delaware County, located just north of Columbus, is the fastest-growing county in Ohio. Its population according to the 2000 census was 109,989. By 2003 its population had grown to 132,797, an increase of 20.74%. Voter registration increased from 80,132 in 2000 to 100,676 in 2004, an increase of 25.64%. Voter turnout increased from 55,959 in 2000 to 81,175 in 2004, an increase of 45.06%, the largest of any county in Ohio. Voter turnout as a percentage of registered voters was reportedly 80.63% county wide, the highest of any county in the state. Turnout reached as high as 91.18% in Powell City, Precinct G, and 91.01% in Concord Township, Precinct C.

In Delaware County, there were 24,942 more votes counted for president in 2004 than in 2000. In order for Bush to have made the gains awarded to him in the official results, he must have gotten the votes of at least 16,239 (65.11%) of 19,202 new voters, or the equivalent, assuming with good reason that the Green voters did not support Bush.

DELAWARE COUNTY	Republican	Democratic	Green	Others
2004	53,143 66.05%	27,048 33.62%	1 0.00%	264 0.33%
2000	36,639 66.00%	17,134 30.87%	1,212 2.18%	529 0.95%
Difference	16,504	9,914	-1,211	-265

Because the township totals provided by the Board of Elections sometimes include cities listed separately in the precinct totals, it was not possible to avoid duplication of some vote totals. This made it impossible to compile an accurate table listing the vote totals for each city and township in the county, so I have not reproduced it here. My attempt to do so did reveal seven cities and townships worth examining at the precinct level:

DELAWARE COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, PRESIDENTIAL AND ISSUE ONE

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
Dublin City	2143	1701	442	691	1064	-373
Powell City	3496	2939	557	1530	1968	-438
Westerville City	2754	2451	303	1382	1631	-249
Concord Township	2922	2558	364	1261	1540	-279
Genoa Township	7842	7099	743	3403	3991	-588
Liberty Township	5202	4428	774	2117	2675	-558
Orange Township	6454	5698	756	3067	3542	-475

For each of the seven cities and townships, each precinct is listed below. Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in each of 59 precincts in these cities and townships. Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in all but one precinct, and he ran even in that one.

DUBLIN CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
DUBLIN CITY 3A	443	151	367	209	76	-58
DUBLIN CITY 3B	466	143	369	233	97	-90
DUBLIN CITY 3C	591	197	459	310	132	-113
DUBLIN CITY 3D	643	200	506	312	137	-112

In Dublin City, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 373 of 2853 ballots cast (13.1%), ranging as high as 90 of 612 (14.7%) in Precinct 3B. City wide, Issue One got 61.5% of the vote, while Bush got 75.6% of the vote.

POWELL CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
POWELL CITY A	383	174	306	239	77	-65
POWELL CITY B	415	134	342	189	73	-55
POWELL CITY C	592	276	502	340	90	-64
POWELL CITY D	434	158	373	214	61	-56
POWELL CITY E	445	245	381	295	64	-50
POWELL CITY F	405	201	332	269	73	-68
POWELL CITY G	822	342	703	422	119	-80

In Powell City, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 438 of 5,065 ballots cast (8.6%), ranging as high as 65 of 560 (11.6%) in Precinct A. City wide, Issue One got 59.9% of the vote, while Bush got 69.6% of the vote.

WESTERVILLE CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
WESTERVILLE CITY A	612	348	575	367	37	-19
WESTERVILLE CITY B	368	176	299	234	69	-58
WESTERVILLE CITY C	404	190	335	251	69	-61
WESTERVILLE CITY D	484	268	450	298	34	-30
WESTERVILLE CITY E	521	221	444	288	77	-67
WESTERVILLE CITY F	365	179	348	193	17	-14

In Westerville City, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 249 of 4199 ballots cast (5.9%), ranging as high as 58 of 553 (10.5%) in Precinct B. City wide, Issue One got 60.0% of the vote, while Bush got 66.6% of the vote.

CONCORD TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
CONCORD TOWNSHIP A	430	234	405	250	25	-16
CONCORD TOWNSHIP B	593	189	511	257	82	-68
CONCORD TOWNSHIP C	1015	430	870	540	145	-110
CONCORD TOWNSHIP D	226	112	198	130	28	-18
CONCORD TOWNSHIP E	658	296	574	363	84	-67

In Concord Township, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 279 of 4221 ballots cast (6.6%), ranging as high as 68 of 788 (8.6%) in Precinct B. In the entire township, Issue One got 62.4% of the vote, while Bush got 69.9% of the vote.

GENOA TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
GENOA TOWNSHIP A	389	202	346	173	43	-29
GENOA TOWNSHIP B	517	205	506	205	11	0
GENOA TOWNSHIP C	531	200	461	259	70	-59
GENOA TOWNSHIP D	494	269	464	285	30	-16
GENOA TOWNSHIP E	771	261	659	350	112	-89
GENOA TOWNSHIP F	389	159	339	206	50	-47
GENOA TOWNSHIP G	468	205	432	232	36	-27
GENOA TOWNSHIP H	489	263	444	288	45	-25
GENOA TOWNSHIP I	800	327	675	421	125	-94
GENOA TOWNSHIP J	576	291	537	306	39	-15
GENOA TOWNSHIP K	621	276	584	294	37	-18
GENOA TOWNSHIP L	653	210	556	283	97	-73
GENOA TOWNSHIP M	531	296	520	297	11	-1
GENOA TOWNSHIP N	613	319	576	328	37	-9

In Genoa Township, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 502 of 11,440 ballots cast (4.4%), ranging as high as 94 of 1136 (8.3%) in Precinct I. In the entire township, Issue One got 64.0% of the vote, while Bush got 69.7% of the vote.

LIBERTY TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP A	459	188	401	227	58	-39
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP B	455	213	417	241	38	-28
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP C	655	218	541	305	114	-87
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP D	274	126	212	174	61	-48
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP E	434	129	360	184	74	-55
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP F	510	165	412	242	98	-77
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP G	447	244	401	268	46	-24
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP H	556	181	437	276	119	-95
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP I	624	281	557	315	67	-34
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP J	346	169	311	194	35	-25
LIBERTY TOWNSHIP K	442	203	379	249	63	-46

In Liberty Township, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 558 of 7,397 ballots cast (7.5%), ranging as high as 95 of 743 (12.8%) in Precinct H. In the entire township, Issue One got 62.3% of the vote, while Bush got 71.1% of the vote.

ORANGE TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
ORANGE TOWNSHIP A	856	417	743	474	113	-57
ORANGE TOWNSHIP B	584	354	513	394	71	-40
ORANGE TOWNSHIP C	279	146	250	165	29	-19
ORANGE TOWNSHIP D	550	215	473	276	77	-51
ORANGE TOWNSHIP E	380	221	344	237	36	-16
ORANGE TOWNSHIP F	493	163	428	205	65	-42
ORANGE TOWNSHIP G	341	258	329	260	12	-2
ORANGE TOWNSHIP H	586	318	529	350	57	-32
ORANGE TOWNSHIP I	735	264	631	354	104	-90
ORANGE TOWNSHIP J	393	208	356	221	37	-13
ORANGE TOWNSHIP K	835	328	720	409	115	-81
ORANGE TOWNSHIP L	422	175	382	197	40	-22

In Orange Township, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for at least 465 of 9,617 ballots cast (4.8%), ranging as high as 90 of 1,015 (8.9%) in Precinct I. In the entire township, Issue One got 61.7% of the vote, while Bush got 67.8% of the vote.

CLERMONT COUNTY

Clermont County was one of three large counties in southwestern Ohio (the others being Warren and Butler counties) that provided Bush with his entire margin of victory in Ohio. According to the official results, Bush carried these three counties by 132,685 votes, while his plurality statewide was only 118,775 votes. In all three of these counties, Bush actually increased his percentage of the vote compared to the 2000 election, while Kerry received a smaller percentage than Gore in 2000, despite the absence of Ralph Nader from the ballot. In all three counties, the number of ballots cast was up sharply compared to 2000, despite comparatively small population increases. A full analysis is contained in my previous paper, "Election Results in Southwestern Ohio," submitted to the Ohio Supreme Court.

In Clermont County, there were 19,202 more votes counted for president in 2004 than in 2000. In order for Bush to have made the gains awarded to him in the official results, he must have gotten the votes of at least 15,541 (80.93%) of 19,202 new voters, or the equivalent, assuming with good reason that the Green voters did not support Bush.

CLERMONT COUNTY	Republican		Democratic		Green		Others	
2004	62,949	70.67%	25,887	29.06%	4	0.00%	239	0.27%
2000	47,129	67.45%	20,927	29.95%	1,303	1.86%	518	0.74%
Difference	15,820		4,960		-1,299		-279	

The Clermont County results have been officially challenged based upon observations made during the "recount." There are sworn affidavits from recount observers for the Democratic, Green, and Libertarian parties that optical scan ballots were altered, either on Election Night or in preparation for the "recount." Optical scan ballots have ovals next to candidates' names that need to be filled in with a pencil so that the optical scanner can "read" the ballot. Observers saw white stickers over the marks for Kerry-Edwards, and the Bush ovals were colored in, so the optical scanner would count the votes for Bush. We need to examine all ballots for Clermont County to determine how many ballots cast for Kerry were altered to become ballots counted for Bush. There will be DNA on the stickers, and if the ballot was not an "overvote" to begin with there will be different graphite on the Bush ovals than on the rest of the ballot. We also need DNA samples of all persons who had access to the ballots.

CLERMONT COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, PRESIDENTIAL AND ISSUE ONE

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
Amelia Village	962	927	35	449	440	9
Batavia Village	493	463	30	249	253	-4
Batavia Township	5226	4929	297	2173	2168	5
Bethel Village	652	666	-14	291	240	51
Felicity Village	124	149	-25	120	84	36
Franklin Township	948	1023	-75	492	361	131
Goshen Township	4382	4234	148	1719	1707	12
Jackson Township	1029	1003	26	399	376	23
Loveland City	598	514	84	284	338	-54
Milford City	2108	1945	163	1107	1193	-86
<u>Miami Township</u>	15679	13769	1910	5583	6718	-1135
Monroe Township	2151	2108	43	912	853	59
Moscow Village	86	82	4	39	42	-3

## CLERMONT COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, CONTINUED

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
New Richmond Village	572	566	6	355	317	38
Newtonsville Village	102	122	-20	45	25	20
Ohio Township	779	722	57	338	364	26
Owensville Vill.	226	221	5	137	130	7
Pierce Township	4342	3869	473	1666	1944	-278
Stonelick Township	1995	1904	91	767	786	-19
Tate Township	2310	2367	-57	864	731	133
<u>Union Township</u>	14575	12880	1695	6161	6633	-472
Washington Township	551	605	-54	348	251	97
Wayne Township	1346	1394	-48	569	466	103
Williamsburg Village	1710	1712	-2	798	686	112

In Clermont County there are several cities and towns where Bush received far more votes than Issue One. By far the largest of these are Miami Township and Union Township. Because the precinct canvass records are available online only in Adobe format, I am unable to rearrange the data without retyping it myself. Therefore I have prepared tables showing only the precincts with the greatest variance from the state wide pattern.

MIAMI TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
MIAMI TOWNSHIP A	717	281	615	342	102	-61
MIAMI TOWNSHIP B	622	273	508	314	114	-41
MIAMI TOWNSHIP C	942	230	796	335	146	-105
MIAMI TOWNSHIP J	729	229	623	302	106	-73
MIAMI TOWNSHIP X	954	297	792	394	162	-97
MIAMI TOWNSHIP Y	654	205	518	306	136	-101
MIAMI TOWNSHIP Z	734	202	585	324	149	-122

In Miami Township, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 38 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in 33 of 38 precincts. In the seven precincts shown above, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 600 of 7,122 ballots cast (8.4%), ranging as high as 101 of 868 (11.6%) in Precinct Y, and 122 of 940 (13.0%) in Precinct Z. In the entire township, out of 21,457 ballots cast, at least 1,172 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 67.2% of the vote, while Bush got 73.7% of the vote.

UNION TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
UNION TOWNSHIP A	889	260	771	348	118	-88
UNION TOWNSHIP E	878	305	746	373	132	-68
UNION TOWNSHIP B1B	541	197	421	273	120	-76
UNION TOWNSHIP F1F	527	151	430	193	97	-42
UNION TOWNSHIP P1P	501	171	421	226	80	-55

In Union Township, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 40 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in 27 of 40 precincts. In the five precincts shown above, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 329 of 4,452 ballots cast (7.4%), ranging as high as 76 of 745 (10.2%) in Precinct B1B. In the entire township, out of 20,965 ballots cast, at least 609 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 66.0% of the vote, while Bush got 70.3% of the vote.

WARREN COUNTY

Warren County, a Republican stronghold northeast of Cincinnati, came to national attention on election night. While the nation awaited returns from Ohio, the state that would decide the election, county officials locked down the administrative building and prohibited all independent observers from watching the vote count. According to the Cincinnati Enquirer, "County officials initially said they feared that having reporters and photographers present could interfere with the ballot counting. They subsequently cited homeland security concerns. ... Besides locking the doors, the county had two pickup trucks out front, police in the building, and a bomb-sniffing dog." However, both state and federal homeland security officials have said they were unaware of any terrorist threat to Warren County. All of this only served to focus public attention on Warren County, and people began to question the vote count.

In Warren County, there were 25,202 more votes counted for president in 2004 than in 2000. In order for Bush to have made the gains awarded to him in the official results, he must have gotten the votes of at least 19,364 (76.84%) of 25,202 new voters, or the equivalent, assuming with good reason that the Green voters did not support Bush.

WARREN COUNTY	Republican		Democratic		Green		Others	
2004	68,037	72.06%	26,044	27.58%	3	0.00%	338	0.36%
2000	48,318	69.80%	19,142	27.66%	1,067	1.54%	693	1.00%
Difference	19,719		6,902		-1,064		-355	

In Warren County, six cities and townships stand out as highly suspect: Clear Creek Township, Deerfield Township, Hamilton Township, Lebanon City, Mason City, and Springboro City. These are the same six jurisdictions which I singled out in my previous paper, entitled "Election Results in Southwestern Ohio," submitted to the Ohio Supreme Court. I noted that Bush's inflated margin of victory in Warren County came primarily from these six cities and townships (Bush won a plurality of 28,869 votes in 2004, compared to 19,822 votes in 2000), and that all of them reported extraordinary increases in voter registration (from 59,336 in 2000 to 81,355 in 2004, an increase of 37.1%).

WARREN COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, PRESIDENTIAL AND ISSUE ONE

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
Carlisle City	1341	1455	-114	694	503	191
<u>Clear Creek Township</u>	4997	4550	447	1574	1855	-281
<u>Deerfield Township</u>	11319	10059	1260	4529	5343	-814
Franklin City	3124	3414	-290	1832	1406	426
Franklin Township	4562	4971	-409	2557	2006	551
<u>Hamilton Township</u>	6226	5585	641	2097	2523	-426
Harlan Township	1866	1781	85	557	574	-17
Harveysburg	188	188	0	73	73	0
<u>Lebanon City</u>	5956	5584	372	2278	2476	-198
Maineville	343	314	29	110	29	-19
<u>Mason City</u>	10858	9742	1116	3805	4462	-657
Massie Township	250	244	6	99	91	8
Middletown City	2187	2221	-34	1015	880	135
Morrow Village	283	279	4	162	157	5
Salem Township	1293	1188	105	458	524	-66
South Lebanon Village	816	793	23	387	362	25
<u>Springboro City</u>	5985	5278	707	2189	2571	-382

WARREN COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, CONTINUED

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
Turtle Creek Township	4161	4034	127	1219	1241	-22
Union Township	1011	951	43	306	330	-24
Washington Township	931	881	50	293	301	-8
Wayne Township	2019	1910	109	668	701	-33
Waynesville	1027	967	60	417	458	-41

In each of these six jurisdictions, Bush ran well ahead of the "Yes" votes on Issue One, and Kerry ran far behind the "No" votes on Issue One, which is the exact opposite of the state wide trend exemplified, even in Warren County, in Carlisle City, Franklin City, and Franklin Township. I have prepared tables showing every precinct in the six suspect cities and townships of Warren County, by rearranging the data file posted on the Board of Elections website at <http://www.co.warren.oh.us/bdelec/> This was a tedious procedure, as the precinct names are all in code, and the precincts are scattered about the canvass records at random rather than being arranged in lists for each jurisdiction. I know of no other Board of Elections in Ohio that reports its election results in such a manner.

In Lebanon City, the presidential vote closely resembled the vote on Issue One in 7 of 14 precincts, where only 17 gay marriage supporters are needed in order to explain the vote totals for Bush. And yet, in other precincts in the same city, gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 49 of 593 ballots cast (8.3%) in Precinct LEB C M AAL, 58 of 661 (8.8%) in LEB C SEB AFY, and 79 of 845 (9.4%) in LEB C SW AAT. City wide, out of 8,372 ballots cast, at least 232 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 69.3% of the vote, while Bush got 72.3% of the vote.

LEBANON CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
LEB C EA AAJ	313	150	299	151	14	-1
LEB C EB AAK	276	124	255	127	21	-3
LEB C M AAL	347	234	377	185	-30	49
LEB C N AAN	497	164	492	170	5	-6
LEB C NM AAM	460	173	449	180	11	-7
LEB C NWA AAO	479	146	440	159	39	-13
LEB C NWB AAP	544	202	497	233	47	-31
LEB C SE AAR	392	163	384	160	8	3
LEB C SM AAS	289	137	248	165	41	-28
LEB C SW AAT	623	203	538	282	85	-79
LEB C NWC AAQ	443	160	423	160	20	0
LEB C SEA AFG	441	155	400	181	41	-26
LEB C SEB AFY	510	138	444	196	66	-58
LEB C W AFZ	342	129	338	127	4	2

In Springboro City, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in 12 of 15 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in 11 of 15 precincts. Gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 67 of 831 ballots cast (8.1%) in Precinct SPG C SE AFB, 62 of 667 (9.3%) in SPG C EM AEV, 65 of 696 (9.3%) in SPG NEA AFN, and 65 of 683 (9.5%) in SPG C NE AEX. City wide, out of 8,250 ballots cast, at least 441 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 67.2% of the vote, while Bush got 73.2% of the vote.



SPRINGBORO CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
SPG C EA AES	323	131	290	144	33	-13
SPG C M AEW	236	131	240	110	-4	21
SPG C NWA AEY	286	104	258	123	28	-19
SPG C SW AFC	312	152	323	123	-11	29
SPG C W AFD	290	109	291	101	-1	8
SPG C EB AET	504	151	422	202	82	-51
SPG C NWB AEZ	290	112	259	134	31	-22
SPG C SE AFB	606	220	507	287	99	-67
SPG C EC AEU	298	144	280	143	18	1
SPG C NWC AFA	373	132	327	153	46	-21
SPG C EM AEV	507	151	413	213	94	-62
SPG C NE AEX	516	159	430	224	86	-65
SPG C NEA AFN	537	154	438	219	99	-65
SPG C SEA AFO	470	185	419	208	51	-23
SPG C NEB AFX	437	154	381	187	56	-33

In Mason City, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 23 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in all but one precinct. The most egregious example is Precinct MAS C NEA AAY where, out of 623 ballots cast, 76 (12.2%) were gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush. Issue One got 63.7% of the vote, while Bush got 76.7% of the vote, excluding third parties. City wide, out of 14,893 ballots cast, at least 672 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 68.6% of the vote, while Bush got 74.1% of the vote.

MASON CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
MAS C EA AAU	631	211	579	232	52	-21
MAS C EB AAV	368	184	336	193	32	-9
MAS C M AAX	306	133	293	142	13	-9
MAS C NE AAZ	361	107	323	128	38	-21
MAS C SE ABB	585	193	524	234	61	-41
MAS C SM ABC	265	122	251	125	14	-3
MAS C SWA ABE	443	165	418	175	25	-10
MAS C W ABI	621	233	571	258	50	-25
MAS C SWB ABF	363	125	335	137	28	-12
MAS C EC AAW	363	114	335	128	28	-14
MAS C SWC ABG	477	163	445	180	32	-17
MAS C S ABD	490	252	465	237	25	15
MAS C NEA AAY	471	143	385	219	86	-76
MAS C SA ABA	490	196	411	248	79	-52
MAS C WA ABH	499	192	451	221	48	-29
MAS C NW AFE	385	154	345	183	40	-29
MAS C SB AFF	456	162	426	164	30	-2
MAS C WB AFL	754	187	645	260	91	-73
MAS C NWA AFP	591	161	524	211	67	-50
MAS C WC AFS	574	196	483	257	91	-61
MAS C NEB AFU	484	169	437	203	57	-34
MAS C NEC AFV	547	152	471	209	76	-57
MAS C SC AFW	334	91	289	118	45	-27

In Clear Creek Township, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in 8 of 9 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in the same 8 precincts. Gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 68 of 579 ballots cast (11.7%) in Precinct CLC T WA ABP, and 93 of 839 (11.1%) in CLC T NM ABM. In the entire township, out of 6,650 ballots cast, at least 313 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 71.0% of the vote, while Bush got 76.0% of the vote.

CLEAR CREEK TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
CLC T EA ABJ	744	237	676	276	68	-39
CLC T EB ABK	633	175	589	210	44	-35
CLC T SA ABN	472	141	435	164	37	-23
CLC T SB ABO	482	178	460	184	22	-6
CLC T WA ABP	447	123	361	191	86	-68
CLC T WB ABQ	507	207	516	175	-9	32
CLC T M ABL	656	194	602	228	54	-34
CLC T NM ABM	650	187	533	280	117	-93
CLC T EC AFK	406	132	378	147	28	-15

In Deerfield Township, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 25 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in all but one precinct. Gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush included 57 of 682 ballots cast (8.4%) in Precinct DEF T SEC ABZ, 54 of 630 (8.6%) in DEF T M ABU, and 68 of 790 (8.6%) in DEF T SWC ACG. In the entire township, out of 16,047 ballots cast, at least 818 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 65.3% of the vote, while Bush got 71.4% of the vote.

DEERFIELD TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
DEF T KM ABS	488	150	430	199	58	-49
DEF T LP ABT	446	219	412	241	34	-22
DEF T N ABW	738	198	638	267	100	-69
DEF T SEA ABX	426	185	378	218	48	-33
DEF T SM ACD	464	218	416	245	48	-27
DEF T SW ACH	523	200	461	238	62	-38
DEF T SEB ABY	376	175	326	206	50	-31
DEF T SEC ABZ	475	200	400	257	75	-57
DEF T W ACK	482	137	416	182	66	-45
DEF T M ABU	450	171	389	225	61	-54
DEF T NM ABV	345	165	291	197	54	-32
DEF T WM ACJ	555	270	522	274	33	-4
DEF T EM ABR	345	132	290	171	55	-39
DEF T SMA ACA	319	87	276	123	43	-36
DEF T SWA ACE	484	209	459	219	25	-10
DEF T WMA ACI	420	178	387	201	33	-23
DEF T SMB ACB	448	231	402	266	46	-35
DEF T SWB ACF	377	122	340	147	37	-25
DEF T SMC ACC	285	139	260	152	25	-13
DEF T SWC ACG	612	174	514	242	98	-68
DEF T WMB AFH	466	231	429	237	37	-6
DEF T NMA AFI	348	133	299	169	49	-36
DEF T S AFJ	430	157	402	180	28	-23
DEF T WMC AFM	564	259	489	302	75	-43
DEF T WA AFT	453	189	433	185	20	4

In Hamilton Township, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 10 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in all but one precinct. Gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 82 of 836 ballots cast (9.8%) in Precinct HAM T WB ADK, 70 of 869 (8.1%) in HAM T S ADI, and 82 of 1058 (7.8%) in HAM T WA ADJ. In the entire township, out of 8,447 ballots cast, at least 428 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 68.9% of the vote, while Bush got 74.8% of the vote.

HAMILTON TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
HAM T E ADD	485	188	453	201	32	-13
HAM T NM ADG	578	158	536	194	42	-36
HAM T NW ADH	747	182	676	251	71	-69
HAM T S ADI	662	197	573	267	89	-70
HAM T M ADF	551	193	507	216	44	-23
HAM T WA ADJ	752	302	634	384	118	-82
HAM T WB ADK	665	164	551	246	114	-82
HAM T NMA AFQ	774	260	721	293	53	-33
HAM T WC AFR	474	220	442	218	32	2
HAM T MA AGA	538	233	492	253	46	-20

BUTLER COUNTY

Butler County provided Bush with his largest margin of victory of any county in Ohio (a plurality of 53,629 votes). In Butler County there were 29,802 more votes counted for president in 2004 than in 2000. In order for Bush to have made the gains awarded to him in the official results, he must have gotten the votes of at least 22,651 (76.00%) of 29,802 new voters, or the equivalent, assuming with good reason that the Green voters did not support Bush.

BUTLER COUNTY	Republican		Democratic		Green	Others	
2004	109,872	65.86%	56,243	33.72%	6	0.00%	698 0.42%
2000	86,587	63.19%	46,390	33.86%	2,708	1.98%	1,332 0.97%
Difference	23,285		9,853		-2,702		-634

In Butler County, Bush ran only 93 votes (0.085%) ahead of the "Yes" votes on Issue One, while Kerry ran 4,781 votes (9.3%) ahead of the "No" Votes on Issue One. But even this is inconsistent with the statewide trend, in which Kerry ran 32.71% ahead of the "No" votes, and Bush ran 14.10% behind the "Yes" votes. Some jurisdictions in Butler County show a vote distribution similar to the state wide pattern, for example: Hamilton City, where Kerry ran 30.46% ahead of the "No" votes, and Bush ran 7.88% behind the "Yes" votes; and Middletown City, where Kerry ran 46.51% ahead of the "No" votes, and Bush ran 17.87% behind the "Yes" votes. However, there are three sizeable cities and townships where the reverse is true: Liberty Township, and West Chester Township, and Oxford City.

BUTLER COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, PRESIDENTIAL AND ISSUE ONE

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
Fairfield City	14532	14487	45	7188	6530	658
Fairfield Township	7769	7625	144	3003	2894	109
Hamilton City	14876	16149	-1273	9795	7508	2287
Hanover Township	3337	3307	30	1241	1173	68
Lemon Township	342	410	-68	276	180	96
<u>Liberty Township</u>	11952	10840	1112	3519	4232	-713
Madison Township	2734	2849	-115	1329	1088	241
Middletown City	10330	12578	-2248	8889	6067	2822
Milford Township	1260	1234	26	588	592	-4
Monroe City	3499	3511	-12	1443	1360	83
Morgan Township	2406	2234	172	681	736	-55
<u>Oxford City</u>	3071	2460	611	3965	4312	-347

BUTLER COUNTY, COMPARISON OF VOTE, CONTINUED

	Bush	Yes	Diff.	Kerry	No	Diff.
Oxford Township	724	691	33	646	657	-11
Reily Township	1056	1027	29	478	500	-22
Ross Township	2883	2733	150	953	1028	-75
St. Clair Township	1962	2062	-100	1040	835	205
Trenton City	3285	3556	-271	1579	1250	329
<u>West Chester Township</u>	21225	19391	1834	8379	9386	-1007
Wayne Township	1811	1893	-82	788	654	134
Sharonville City	767	695	72	428	456	-28

I have prepared tables showing every precinct in the three suspect cities and townships of Warren County, by rearranging the data file posted on the Board of Elections website at <http://www.butlercountyelections.org>

West Chester Township first came to my attention when I compared the vote totals for the Presidential race with those of the Chief Justice race. A serious question had been raised as to how C. Ellen Connally, a little-known, underfunded, African-American municipal judge from Cleveland, running for Chief Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court against Thomas J. Moyer, a well-financed incumbent, in a race that drew 1.2 million fewer votes, statewide, than did the presidential race, could have received more votes than John Kerry in 13 of 88 counties. By far the largest of these counties were Butler, Clermont, and Warren, all in southwestern Ohio.

To investigate this question, I calculated, for each precinct, the number of ballots cast that were not for Connally (that is, votes for Moyer plus votes for no one), and compared these numbers with the votes awarded to Bush. The results reveal, on a precinct by precinct basis, how many, if any, of C. Ellen Connally's supporters must have voted for George W. Bush, in order for the official results to be true and correct.

I found that the number of votes not cast for Connally were nowhere near sufficient to account for the number of votes awarded to Bush. What the official results are saying is that, in these three counties, there were 13,577 people who voted for C. Ellen Connally for Chief Justice, and for George W. Bush for President: 7,440 people in Butler County, 3,580 people in Clermont County, and 2,557 people in Warren County. By far the highest number was in West Chester Township, where 1,755 voters, must have voted for both Connally and Bush. And these numbers are an absolute minimum. They are derived from an extremely conservative assumption, that all of the people who voted for neither candidate for Chief Justice voted for Bush for President. For every one of these who voted for Kerry, there would have to be yet another person who voted for both Connally and Bush. This story was reported in detail in my paper entitled "One More Look at Southwestern Ohio," submitted to the Ohio Supreme Court.

Also in West Chester Township, as it turns out, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in 41 of 45 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in 38 of 45 precincts. Gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush range as high as 68 of 696 (9.8%) in Precinct 5LR. In the entire township, out of 29,926 ballots cast, at least 1,213 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 67.4% of the vote, while Bush got 71.7% of the vote.

WEST CHESTER TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LA	403	201	391	194	12	7
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LB	618	214	519	281	99	-67
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LC	459	160	427	169	32	-9
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LD	622	255	576	283	46	-28
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LE	333	131	299	152	34	-21
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LF	456	186	429	191	27	-5
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LG	492	179	460	197	32	-18
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LH	475	154	448	165	27	-11
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LI	410	182	361	202	49	-20
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LJ	376	143	357	149	19	-6
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LK	517	197	482	213	35	-16
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LL	570	263	542	276	28	-13
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LM	472	168	411	211	61	-43
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LN	346	153	333	158	13	-5
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LO	580	172	538	205	42	-33
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LP	535	233	497	251	38	-18
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LQ	561	183	489	233	72	-50
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LR	404	141	362	162	42	-21
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LS	512	244	474	261	38	-17
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LT	637	180	564	225	73	-45
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LU	418	164	412	157	6	7
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LV	573	175	489	240	84	-65
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LW	635	199	558	252	77	-53
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LX	566	201	493	262	73	-61
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LY	589	214	488	283	101	-69
WEST CHESTER TWP 4LZ	391	126	344	158	47	-32
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LA	404	127	337	171	77	-44
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LB	338	167	339	151	-1	16
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LC	876	418	856	399	20	19
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LD	211	211	256	154	-45	57
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LE	425	157	360	202	65	-45
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LF	330	118	309	131	21	-13
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LG	336	167	300	199	36	-32
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LH	349	154	309	178	40	-24
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LI	171	164	192	132	-21	32
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LJ	278	123	249	138	29	-15
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LK	533	187	472	223	61	-36
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LL	485	153	415	198	70	-45
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LM	492	144	431	183	61	-39
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LN	413	151	361	189	52	-38
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LO	631	162	558	222	73	-60
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LP	502	194	466	220	36	-26
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LQ	693	236	612	300	81	-64
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LR	378	307	414	239	-36	68
WEST CHESTER TWP 5LS	430	221	412	227	18	-6

Liberty Township accounted for 24.5% of the reported increase in Bush's margin of victory in Butler County (Bush won a plurality of 8,433 votes in Liberty Township in 2004, compared to 5,147 votes in 2000). Compared to 2000 there was reportedly a 41.02% increase in voter registration and a 46.43% increase in voter turnout, even though the population increased by only 3.12% county wide; and the increase in voter registration, as a percentage, is wildly distributed throughout the township. In three precincts alone, one of them brand new, the other two with reported increases in voter registration of 177.9% and 143.5%, Bush's margin of victory increased by 1583 votes compared to 2000. In six other precincts, each with a reported increase in voter registration of more than 30%, Bush enjoyed a net gain of 924 votes. These phenomena were reported in my previous paper entitled "Election Results in Southwestern Ohio," submitted to the Ohio Supreme Court. Also in Liberty Township, there were at least 1,374 persons who voted for both C. Ellen Connally and George W. Bush.

In Liberty Township, Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 20 precincts, and Kerry ran behind the "No" votes in all 20 precincts. Gay marriage supporters who voted for Bush accounted for 82 of 923 ballots cast (8.9%) in Precinct 4DF, and 121 of 1580 (7.7%) in Precinct 4DI. In the entire township, out of 15,641 ballots cast, at least 713 gay marriage supporters voted for Bush. Issue One got 71.9% of the vote, while Bush got 77.3% of the vote. The numbers from West Chester Township and Liberty Township illustrate perfectly why election investigators must examine the results at the town and precinct levels. At the county level, these numbers are offset by the normal vote distributions in Hamilton City and Middletown City.

LIBERTY TOWNSHIP	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
LIBERTY TWP 4DA	649	169	556	228	93	-59
LIBERTY TWP 4DB	750	233	716	244	34	-11
LIBERTY TWP 4DC	656	209	615	232	40	-23
LIBERTY TWP 4DD	537	173	503	203	34	-30
LIBERTY TWP 4DE	499	173	468	178	31	-5
LIBERTY TWP 4DF	748	163	649	245	99	-82
LIBERTY TWP 4DG	726	193	649	229	77	-36
LIBERTY TWP 4DH	473	176	429	210	44	-34
LIBERTY TWP 4DI	1264	295	1110	416	154	-121
LIBERTY TWP 4DJ	477	143	424	184	53	-41
LIBERTY TWP 4DK	415	148	389	158	26	-10
LIBERTY TWP 4DL	498	192	474	195	24	-3
LIBERTY TWP 4DM	312	73	296	85	16	-12
LIBERTY TWP 4DN	366	114	343	129	23	-15
LIBERTY TWP 4DO	1015	284	918	342	97	-58
LIBERTY TWP 4DP	613	193	545	238	68	-45
LIBERTY TWP 4DQ	519	168	475	190	44	-22
LIBERTY TWP 4DR	355	96	314	124	41	-28
LIBERTY TWP 4DS	390	144	348	168	42	-24
LIBERTY TWP 4DT	690	180	619	234	71	-54

Oxford City is home to Miami University. While Bush ran ahead of the "Yes" votes in all 15 precincts, Kerry still won the city, handily. Issue One was defeated with 63.7% of the vote, while Kerry won 56.3% of the vote. In 2000, Al Gore received only 41.2% of the vote in Oxford City. It stands to reason that a proposal to outlaw gay marriage would encounter strong opposition on the campus of a state college, where many young Republicans might be more tolerant on the matter. There is no evidence that the election results were altered in Oxford City.

OXFORD CITY	BUSH	KERRY	YES	NO	DIFFERENCE	
OXFORD CITY 4HA	148	152	86	190	62	-38
OXFORD CITY 4HB	260	396	179	440	81	-44
OXFORD CITY 4HC	332	508	301	531	31	-23
OXFORD CITY 4HD	146	239	144	235	2	4
OXFORD CITY 4HE	73	131	46	151	27	20
OXFORD CITY 4HF	148	197	93	225	55	-28
OXFORD CITY 4HG	156	149	107	184	49	-35
OXFORD CITY 4HH	122	233	103	248	19	-15
OXFORD CITY 4HI	276	334	274	330	2	4
OXFORD CITY 4HJ	273	287	233	319	40	-32
OXFORD CITY 4HK	329	287	208	370	121	-83
OXFORD CITY 4HL	191	251	139	271	52	-20
OXFORD CITY 4HM	283	356	253	369	30	-13
OXFORD CITY 5HA	220	269	189	272	31	-3
OXFORD CITY 5HB	114	176	105	177	9	-1

CONCLUSION

Actually, I do not really believe that thousands of voters in four Ohio counties, all of them Republican strongholds, went to the polls last November to cast their votes in favor of both gay marriage and George W. Bush. There may have been some voters who did this, but surely not 3500 voters in Delaware County, 2000 voters in Clermont County, 3000 in Warren County, and 2000 in Butler County. There is a small organization of loyal Republicans, known as the "Log Cabin Republicans," who happen to be gay, but they declined to endorse George W. Bush for president in 2004 because of his opposition to civil unions. And yet, statistically, there is no way to account for the official election results in these four counties without a minimum of 10,500 voters opposing Issue One while supporting George W. Bush, just as there is no way to account for the official election results in three of these same counties without a minimum of 13,500 voters supporting both Ellen Connally and George W. Bush, or without 65% to 80% of new voters choosing Bush over John F. Kerry. No matter how I look at these election results, the numbers do not add up. The official, certified results cannot be true and correct. It is my professional opinion, having exhaustively studied the election results in these counties, that the true vote counts were altered, and that tens of thousands of votes were shifted from Kerry to Bush.

I must emphasize again that 10,500 is the absolute minimum number of voters who must have opposed Issue One and supported George W. Bush in these four counties. Either that, or the official results are not true and correct. Statewide, Bush ran 14.10% behind the "Yes" vote on Issue One, and Kerry ran 32.71% ahead of the "No" vote on Issue One. Had the same pattern prevailed in Butler, Clermont, Delaware and Warren counties, Bush would have carried them by a combined plurality of only 59,928 votes, rather than the margin of 158,779 votes reported in the official results. This implies that as many as 50,000 votes may have been shifted from Kerry to Bush, thus affecting the margin by 100,000 votes.

County	Yes Vote	No Vote	x 0.8590	x 1.3271
Butler	109,779	51,462	94,300	68,295
Clermont	58,172	27,108	49,970	35,975
Delaware	48,844	29,696	41,957	39,410
Warren	63,431	27,960	54,487	37,106
Total	280,226	136,226	240,714	180,786

It is true that there must have been some Republicans, not of the Log Cabin persuasion, who voted against Issue One and for George W. Bush. Issue One restricted anything that approximated gay marriage, and so was opposed by many businesses on the ground that it would interfere with their ability to recruit and maintain a high-quality workforce. But why should such voters have been concentrated in these four counties, where the election results have been challenged on other grounds as well?

All four of these counties have a "paper trail" - punch card ballots in Butler, Delaware and Warren counties, optically scanned ballots in Clermont County. We need to examine the best forensic evidence. We need to look at the paper.